

What Is at Stake in the Interaction between Media Arts and Cultural Industries in Lebanon

I propose here the conditions for a productive interaction between media arts and cultural industries in the current Lebanese art and cultural scene, ranging from an established and conservative art that refers to tradition and embraces the forms and contents of its time to a culturally resistant art that experiments with new forms and messages. The latter is a revolutionary art invoking novelty in opposition to the former conception of art, specific to artists integrated into the milieu of instituted system. Indeed, conservative art in Lebanon is part of a vision that considers that in art, as elsewhere, the end justifies the means, to the extent that money and profit participate in the very definition of art. In this sense, conservative art is based on a practice of repeating preexisting forms of expression. Lebanese conservative art finds its value in economic criteria that prevail over symbolic ones. In other words, a work of art is valued according to the profit it generates. This conception of art forms the basis of an eminently conservative art, which governs institutional art and is akin to stereotyping, a major characteristic of the products of cultural industries. On the other hand, at the antipode of the conservative conception, we see that artists in Lebanon have another conception or vocation of a social nature, whose intent is to preserve peace, reduce social disparities and facilitate dialogue between communities, cultures and religions even to positively change the human being and the world. But we also observe that various avant-garde or even revolutionary practices can maintain a certain bellicose state depending on the territorial context. I should emphasize here that this revolutionary idea of limiting the definition of art to a framework that only summons symbolic values while ignoring economic values, even resisting them, seems today to be an obsolete definition, requiring a reformulation in line with reality.

Starting from the observation of these two conceptions of art and creativity in the Lebanese context, one can wonder where there might be found a productive collaboration based on equal opportunities between agents of resistant art and actors of conservative art who are more a part of the cultural industries. To answer this question, I should note that, at first glance, the divergence of these two antagonistic conceptions might seem problematic. However, this divergence could give way to a fertile convergence, in the sense that the intermediate products under the aegis of a hypothetical intermediate

cultural policy would constitute the fruit of a symbiotic collaboration, given a new ground possessing its own organizational model. In this hypothesis, resistant art would not lose its intrinsic value, its authenticity and its integrity nor undergo a perversion in contact with established art and its commercial and conservative values. For their part, institutional art actors would not be losers in engagement with the world of resistant art, in the sense that the latter do not have to undergo an economic regression due to adoption of noncommercial practice.

In order to try to resolve this conflict, we hypothesize that a new Lebanese cultural policy would develop a neutral ideology, indifferent in some way to progressive and conservative issues, without this indifference posing a problem in the realization of creative products. To test the validity and limits of our hypothetical neutral ideology, I consider what is at stake in the interaction between media arts and cultural industries in Lebanon.

At the outset of this article, a line of questioning is induced by my dual studies in visual arts and cinema majors, my media arts and audiovisual practices and my work in Beirut as a university instructor in these two fields. How do arts agents come into play in the world of cultural industries in Lebanon and vice versa? It is necessary to document and understand what could give rise to tensions and conflicts but also to notice the negotiations between collaborators from these two studied worlds, starting from the idea behind the creative product, followed by its production and ending with its circulation. Indeed, these two worlds share some similarities regarding the production of content with a strong social and creative dimension; the tools of the digitization of information bring them closer together.

What is central to such research is the articulation of three levels of analysis of the interaction between the media arts and the cultural industries:

1. The reality of the interdependence of the two worlds
2. The need for an intermediate zone between the two
3. The feedback effects of intermediation on the art world

In beginning the analysis, we can recognize that due to the radically different nature of both worlds, any collaboration seems infeasible [1]. Nevertheless, we can observe in parallel that this incompatibility is not without exceptions. Artists

in recent history have shown that cultural industries have become the creative variable of artistic production. Indeed, these exceptions are a growing reality, reinforced by the proliferation of means for the digitization of information [2]. At this point in our observations and analysis, interaction between these two worlds becomes potentially fertile.

These observations lead to analysis of the extent to which the two worlds are interdependent and if the need for an intermediate zone between these two worlds is indeed the condition for media arts to become essential in the constitution of creative industries following on their interaction, and perhaps their synergy, with the cultural industries. We therefore can study the multiple relations between the two worlds.

Initially, everything would seem in opposition, such as standard versus original, commercialization versus refusal of the market, conservatism versus avant-gardism. Nevertheless, a mutual interest marginally exists. First, it appears that the professionals of the cultural industries, for instance in Lebanon's TV stations, import from the aesthetics of media arts by integrating them within their productions [3] and vice versa, for instance with the work of the artist Walid Raad, who imported photographs from newspaper archives [4]. However, so far, these relationships operate in the absence of any form of voluntary collaboration.

Progressing in the analysis, we can observe that the relationship between the two worlds can have another form. This occurs when the professionals of both parties voluntarily attempt to collaborate and thus enter into a dialectical relationship, setting up methods of intervention from one world to another, for instance, in the intervention of the artist Ziad Saad in the TV program *Ayoun Beirut* [5]. The contradictory reality and mistrust between the two worlds then shift when the two are winners in a context satisfying the priorities of each one. Indeed, every professional who borrows from a world does more than copy the content; they reconstruct, reelaborate for their own account, and from imported material, new contents. In this sense, this import/export activity itself holds a creative dimension.

From there, we can aim to understand under what conditions this relationship could go beyond a dialectical form. In other words, to progress toward a dynamic and creative relationship. One condition proves to be essential: an intermediary mediator, or broker, must facilitate the interactions. This intervention gives both fields' artists the opportunity to cultivate information and communication in a collaborative context.

This is why I believe it is essential to examine this intermediation zone. More accurately, we need to search for an organizational model adapted to this intermediate space.

First, we notice that cultural industries are moving toward the informational brokerage model that is theorized by Pierre Moeglin [6]. In fact, traditional organizational models are

unable to cope with the large volume of digitized information, leaving the user at a loss in the vast flow of information. Hence the need for a mediator operating with custom-made strategies, arranging the supply and demand of information, while keeping the necessary neutrality; in this respect, we are actually describing the informational brokerage model.

At the same time, we notice that for their part, the media arts also tend toward the informational brokerage model, especially in the presence of digital interactivity and participative devices. Notably, when the artist tends to disappear and play the role of a broker while assigning to the public an artist role.

Therefore, we are interested in the artistic dimension and the feedback effects of intermediation on the art world. Here, we may need to state two assumptions: First, the mediatory activity between cultural industries and media arts can be equated with an artistic practice. Second, the rise of the broker contributes to the registration of media arts in the creative industries.

This is why we revisit historical arts concepts in order to define the creative industries one. In the aftermath of post-modernism, it is evident that artistic activities have oscillated between two poles: a conservative pole [7] and a revolutionary pole [8]. At the crossroads of these two antagonistic conceptions lies that of creative industries, which thus develop a neutral ideology. This neutrality is one characteristic of the informational brokerage model of our hypothesis. This neutral ideology leads to an art of brokerage open to industrialized creativity. In addition, in order to establish brokerage as an artistic practice, we can note a number of examples of artists in the field of communication and digital art.

At this point, we can conclude with three lines of questioning. The first revolves around the redefinition of creativity [9] through the analysis of the relationship between media arts and cultural industries. The creativity here is not about producing novelties from scratch. Creativity is, however, that which consists of arranging new elements in a new way: a creative and industrialized recycling.

The second line of questioning directly concerns the academic world. Our research [10] can be used as a support to setting up informational brokerage workshops.

The third line of questioning is specific to my work as an artist. What art to produce? In my research [11], I explore a path that is neither that of art as a form of resistance nor that of art that reiterates dominant forms of expression. I explore a narrow path where artists feed on what exists and on the dominant values, in order to do something else, something new.

RICARDO MBARKHO

University of Balamand
Lebanese Academy of Fine Arts
Beirut
Lebanon

References and Notes

- 1 Max Horkheimer and Theodor Adorno, *La dialectique de la Raison* (Collection Tel. Gallimard, 1974).
- 2 Ricardo Mbarkho, response to "With the benefit of hindsight, what role does new media play in artistic practices, activism, and as an agent for social change in the Middle East and North Africa to-

- day?”, Ibraaz online forum (2012): www.ibraaz.org/platforms/4/responses/105 (accessed 28 December 2020).
- 3 Ricardo Mbarkho, *Gare de Lyon—Juvisy* (1999): youtu.be/XXpArYPxwuE (accessed 28 December 2020). This video, for instance, was broadcast on the Lebanese TV station NBN for the TV program *Cinéma Beyrouth* in 2004.
 - 4 Walid Raad, *My neck is thinner than a hair: Engines*, MoMA (2001): www.moma.org/learn/moma_learning/walid-raad-my-neck-is-thinner-than-a-hair-engines-1996-2004 (accessed 28 December 2020).
 - 5 Ziad Saad, *Ayoun Beirut*, TV program (2008): www.ziadsaadartwork.blogspot.com (accessed 31 March 2015).
 - 6 Pierre Moeglin, *Outils et médias éducatifs—Une approche communicationnelle* (PU Grenoble, 2005).
 - 7 Camille Paglia, “How Capitalism Can Save Art,” *The Wall Street Journal* (2012): www.online.wsj.com/news/articles/SB10000872396390444223104578034480670026450 (accessed 5 June 2014).
 - 8 Gilles Deleuze, “L’Art et les sociétés de contrôle,” excerpt from lecture given in the context of “Mardis de la Fondation Femis” (17 March 1987): www.youtube.com/watch?v=4ybvyj_Pk7M&t=564s (accessed 22 April 2013).
 - 9 Ricardo Mbarkho, “A Different Kind of Media Creativity in the Lebanon,” in Helmut K. Anheier, ed., *Cultures and Globalization: Cultural Expression, Creativity and Innovation*, The Cultures and Globalization Series (Sage, 2010).
 - 10 Ricardo Mbarak, *Les enjeux de l’interaction entre les arts médiatiques et les industries culturelles*, Sciences de l’information et de la communication (Université Sorbonne Paris Cité, 2017).
 - 11 Ricardo Mbarkho, “Trauma Stimulated Art, or the Embodiment of Affect in Lebanon: An Allegory,” in Meera Atkinson and Michael Richardson, eds., *Traumatic Affect* (Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2013).

Thanks to Our Reviewers

The Leonardo publications are peer reviewed before acceptance; every article is reviewed and commented on by experts among our review board. Based on these reviews we make a decision whether to publish the text. We wish to take this opportunity to thank the reviewers who in the past year have on a volunteer basis spent time writing thoughtful reviews that both help us make a publication decision and help the authors to improve their texts:

Valery Adzhiev, Julieta Aguilera, Daa Ahmed Mohamed Ahmedi, Rima Ahmad Ajlouni, Azadeh Akbari, Ozge Akbulut, Clarissa P. Almeida, Luis Alvarez, James Andean, Rui Filipe Antunes, Miho Aoki, Daniel Alejandro Argente, Ricardo Arias, Judith Aston, Jan Baetens, Pamela Bain, Monika Bakke, Bahareh Barati, Jessica Barness, Heather Barnett, Ben Basing, Marc Battier, Roy Behrens, Zvi Bekerman, Gabrielle Benabdallah, Drew Berry, Maria Cristina Villanova Biasuz, Tom Bickley, Eleonora Bilotta, Jim Bizzocchi, Mike Blow, Heidi Boisvert, N ria Bonet, Candida Borges da Silva, Marc Boucher, Marie-Pier Boucher, Oliver Bown, Candice Boyd, James Boyd, Colleen Boyle, Jeanine Breaker, Terence Broad, Paul Brown, David Brownrigg, Roberta Buiani, Mark Burgin, Claire Burke, Javad Butah, Ana Cantera, David X. Carrier, Richard A. Carter, Carlos Castellanos, Lisa Chandler, Budhaditya Chattopadhyay, Alex Chechile, Cecile Chevalier, Zandrine Chiri, Paolo Cignoni, Ian Clothier, Seth Cluett, Yiannis Colakides, Grayson Cooke, Shana Cooperstein, Alessio Corti, Giovanna Costantini, Cathy L. Cox, Fiona Crisp, Gina Czarniecki-Gables, Ricardo Dal Farra, Mat Dalglish, Rebecca Dalvesco, Gabriella Daris, Daniela de Paulis, Diane Derr, Margaret Dolinsky, Johanna Drucker, Lena Dubinsky, Fr d ric Dufeu, Joel Eaton, Carole Ecoffet, Frank Ekeberg, Taru Elfving, Claire Eliot, Shaltiel Eloul, Tamira Elul, Michele Emmer, Jayanne English, Jos  Carlos Espinel, Alberto T. Est vez, Lucas Evers, Ksenia Fedorova, Nick Fells, Carlos M. Fernandes, Mar a Fernandez, Mikael Fernstr m, Enzo Ferrara, Antenor Ferreira, Jessica Field, Blake Finucane, Francesca Fiorani, Giacomo Fiore, Clio Flego, Preston Foerder, Amalia Foka, Angus Forbes,  va Forg cs, Paul D. Found, Andrea M. Frank, Nazaret Fresno-Ca ada, Ken Friedman, Philip Galanter, Bo Gao, Alex Garcia Topete, Douglas Geers, George Gessert, Ioanna Giannoulatou, Seth Giddings, Toby Gifford, Iain Gilchrist, Gabriel Menotti Gonring, Mar a Gonz lez Valerio, Sam Goree, Gerard Gormley, Marina Estela Gra a, Andy Gracie, Allan Graubard, Dejan Grba, David Gruber, Olivia Guntarik, Alejandro Guzman, Max Haarich, YINUO Han, Juniper Harrower, George Hart, Tracy Harwood, Jens Hauser, Lauren Hayes, Tincuta Heinzl, Linda Henderson, Phillip Hermans, Vera Hesslinger, Jeremy Hight, Craig Hilton, Susan Holden, Heather Houser, Xinran Hu, Nessreen Ibrahim, Jonathan Impett, Amy Ione, Jean M. Ippolito, Jon Ippolito, Ipsa Jain, David James, Mark Jarzombek, Alexander Jensenius, Pavlos Jerenis, Samuel Johnson, Susan Jowsey, Stefano Kalonaris, Aleksandra Kaminska, Haein Kang, Assimina Kaniari, Gizem Karaali, Jenn Karson, Hung Keung, Joey Key, Brian Kinnee, Tara Knight, Ingrid Koenig, Tom Kohut, Maria Kokkori, Kaisu Koski, Nikolaos Koutsoupas, Aaron Kozbelt, Sahra Kunz Gomes, Ayen Kuol, Erin La Cour, Jason Lajoie, Christopher Lakey, Maarten Lamers, Francois-Joseph Lapointe, Silvia Laurentiz, Patrice Le Gal, Byungjoo Lee, Wonjae Lee, Eric Leonardson, Fabian Leotteau, Pernille Leith-Espensen, Augustine Leudar, Abra Levenson, Ellen K. Levy, Lukas Ligeti, Alain Lioret, Samantha Lish, Felipe C sar Londo o, Mick Lorusso, Richard Lowenberg, Will Luers, Natasha Lushetich, Irina Lyubchenko, Heather Madar, Josh Mailman, Angeliki Malakasioti, Siegfried Manietta, Riccardo Manzotti, Angelos Markos, Claudia Martinho, Leno Mascia, Peter Maurits, Gay McAuley, Patrick McCray, Isabel Meirelles, Francesca Mereu, Chris Miall, Brad Miller, Daniel Miller, David Moffat, Aar n Montoya-Moraga, Edmund Mooney, Sybille Moser-Ernst, Lizzie Muller, Jes s Mu oz Morcillo, Dave Murray-Rust, Jon Myers, Teoma Jackson Naccarato, Frieder Nake, Maureen Nappi, Jason Noble, Ziggy O'Reilly, Jeremi Ochab, Aaron Oldenburg, Anna Orrghen, Lindy Orthia, Steven Oscherwitz, Felipe Otondo, Elif Ozcan, Tae Hong Park, Leonardo Parra-Agudelo, Anne Pasek, Ellen Pearlman, Ernesto Pe a, Andy Pepper, Ana Peraica, Jorge Perez-Gallego, Andr  Perrotta, Jahnvi Phalkey, Clifford Pickover, Sheila Pinkel, Louise Poissant, DorothyBelle Poli, Fabrizio Poltronieri, Kate Pullinger, Mojca Puncer, Lance Putnam, Andr  Rabello-Mestre, Misha Rabinovich, Godfried-Willem Raes, Aviva Rahmani, Sharathchandra Ramakrishnan, Andrea Russell, Dominique Raynaud, Amanda Reichelt-Brushett, Santiago Renter a, Everardo Reyes Garcia, Daniel Richter, Amy S. Robbins, Chris Robinson, Manuel Rocha Iturbide, Mailis Rodrigues, Hannah Rogers, Meredith Root-Bernstein, Robert Root-Bernstein, Pilar Rosado, Rodrigo Rosales Gonzalez, David Rosenboom, Camilla Mork Rostvik, Tim Otto Roth, Jess Rowland, Susan Ryan, Linda-Ruth Salter, Eryk Salvaggio, Dario Sanfilippo, Harpreet Sareen, Franziska Schenk, Devon Schiller, Kamala Seals, G nter Seyfried, Helena Shaskevich, Jongcheon Shin, Agueda Simo, Martin Skrodzki, Brian Reffin Smith, Tanja Softic, Christa Sommerer, Vibeke Sorensen, Ver nica Soria-Mart nez, Tami I. Spector, Rejane Spitz, Paul Stapleton, Ewan Stefani, Adam Stieg, Thomas Stoffregen, Darko  trajin, Louise Sundararajan, Ana Tamayo Masero, Paul Thomas, Yvan Tina, Stephen Todd, Yanai Toister, Paz Tornero, Chris Toumey, Andreas Treske, James Trolinger, Barry Truax, Declan Tuite, Robert Twomey, Michael Tymkiw, Carl Unander-Scharin, Andrew Utterson, Alejandro Valencia-Tobon, Ivar van Bekkum, Sjoukje Van Der Meulen, Cathy van Eck, J. David Van Horn, Juan Carlos Vasquez, Julio Velasco, Christine Veras, Federico Visi, Emmanuelle Vital, Stephen Vitiello, Daniel Walzer, Adeljing Wang, Julie Watkins, Patrick Watson, Jon Weinbren, Jillian Weise, Caroline Wellbery, Teresa Wennberg, Claudia Westermann, Graydon Wetzler, Roy Williams, Fabian Winkler, Jen Wood, Arthur Woods, Rewa Wright, Mariela Yeregui, Juppo Yokokawa, John Young, Cristian Zaelzer, Frauke Zeller, He Zhang, Ting Zhou, Yuting Zou

LEONARDO

WHERE ART, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY CONVERGE

PUBLICATIONS

Fearlessly Pioneering Since 1968

- Peer-reviewed journals and books with MIT Press
- Free digital reads
- Graduate abstracts
- Receive 20% off Leonardo Books and Journals—use promo code **LEONARDO20**

PROGRAMS

Making Connections That Matter

- Artist and scientist residencies
- Educators community
- International speakers series

LEONARDO
THE INTERNATIONAL SOCIETY FOR
ARTS + SCIENCES + TECHNOLOGY



Leonardo/ISAST

leonardo.info